



December 21, 2015

**VIA ECF**

The Honorable Frank Maas  
United States District Court  
Southern District of New York  
Daniel Patrick Moynihan U.S. Courthouse  
500 Pearl Street, Room 740  
New York, NY 10007

**RE: *In Re: Terrorist Attacks on September 11, 2001*, 03 MDL 1570 (GBD) (FM)**

Dear Judge Maas:

On behalf of Defendants Sana Bell, Inc. and Sanabel al Kheer, LLC (collectively “Sanabel”), Sanabel’s counsel provides the following Response to Plaintiffs’ Motion to Compel filed on November 13, 2015 (EC 3127) and also respectfully requests an additional sixty (60) days to supplement this Response to Plaintiffs’ Motion to Compel. In short, because Sanabel’s counsel has been unable to connect with Sanabel’s sole representative for approximately twelve (12) months (despite exhaustive efforts to do so, as provided below), Sanabel’s counsel is not in a position to be able to provide a more fulsome response without being able to consult with Sanabel.

Sanabel’s counsel provides the following Response at this stage:

- **Status of Productions**

Sanabel’s current counsel has represented Sanabel since December 2009. Prior to December 2009, Sanabel was represented in this litigation by Mr. Martin McMahon, Esq. During the course of Sanabel’s current counsel’s representation of Sanabel, 5,072 pages (of highly valuable information ranging from bank records to corporate records to important correspondence, among many other types) have been produced from information derived from Sanabel itself and also derived from sources other than Sanabel. At the conclusion of its most recent production in 2013, Sanabel was on record with Plaintiffs indicating that all responsive, non-privileged information in Sanabel’s possession, custody and control had been produced.

- **Current Status of Sanabel’s Sole Representative – And Ability of Sanabel’s Counsel to Respond to Plaintiffs’ Motion to Compel**

Sanabel’s counsel has not been able to reach Sanabel’s current sole representative, Dr. Abdel Hillali, for approximately twelve (12) months, despite exhaustive efforts to do so. Sanabel’s counsel is concerned that Dr. Hillali may be gravely ill (he has suffered a heart attack during the pendency of Sanabel’s counsel’s



representation), may not be in the country or could be deceased. Sanabel's counsel has attempted to contact Dr. Hillali by phone, mail, text message and in person at his last known address on numerous occasions without success. When visiting Dr. Hillali's last known address (a condominium), Sanabel's counsel spoke with security officers at the front desk (who did not know Dr. Hillali's whereabouts) and also left written information with the security officers to deliver to Dr. Hillali. In addition, Sanabel's counsel has also contacted Dr. Hillali's only known acquaintance but that acquaintance was not aware of his whereabouts. Finally, Sanabel's counsel has inquired with area hospitals and also reviewed death records to determine Dr. Hillali's status to no avail.

As a result, aside from being able to assert that Sanabel has gone on record as saying it has produced all responsive, non-privileged documents within its possession, custody and control, Sanabel's counsel cannot ethically advocate a particular position in response to any other of Plaintiffs' arguments (many of which are raised for the first time in Plaintiffs' Motion to Compel) because Sanabel's counsel is not currently able to ascertain Sanabel's position on these matters, all of which are heavily factually intensive.

Therefore, out of an abundance of caution and in order to protect Sanabel's interests to the fullest extent possible (especially in the face of requests for sanctions and/or a default), Sanabel's counsel has filed this Response but, again, respectfully requests an extension of sixty (60) days within which to supplement this Response in order to provide Sanabel's counsel with more time to reach Dr. Hillali or otherwise ascertain his status.

***I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.***

***Executed on December 21, 2016***

---

Christopher C. S. Manning  
Counsel for Sana Bell, Inc. and Sanabel al Kheer, LLC

cc: The Honorable George B. Daniels (via USPS)  
MDL-1570 Counsel of Record (via ECF)